Theological Touchstone: Wayfinding through Times of Uncertainty

M. Jan Holton

Hic sunt dracones: Here be dragons. This mysterious phrase is etched into the edges of the Hunt-Lenox globe, one of the earliest to depict the "New World."[1] Like ancient maps before it, the globe uses depictions of monsters of various types to convey a sense of danger for areas of the unknown.[2] Though there are few if any remaining uncharted lands today, geographically speaking, the foreboding sense of uncertainty that comes with traversing the unknown remains intimately connected to the "uncharted" territories of our lives.

The past nineteen months of increasing uncertainty caused by a pandemic, political turmoil, wildfires, floods, hurricanes, and the long overdue reckoning over police violence and systemic inequality have challenged me to adjust my perspective on just what crisis means in our current context. The days when we could anticipate life returning to "normal" long enough for us to at least catch our breath are gone. We have passed the threshold of mere crisis and finally tipped into that of *accelerating* and *compounding* crises.[3] The difference is not a subtle one. Global climate changes are responsible for the increased frequency and intensity of potentially catastrophic events, creating a cascade of political, economic, and humanitarian consequences. Yet the results of these changes are by no means limited to large-

M. Jan Holton is a Professor of Pastoral Care at Duke Divinity School.
Email: mholton@div.duke.edu

Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry
ISSN 2325-2847 (print)* ISSN 2325-2855 (online)

scale events. Research suggests that rising temperatures are responsible for an increase in individual illness and, perhaps more surprisingly, deaths by injury, both intentional and unintentional.[4] As with every other aspect of life, persons of color, the elderly, and those living in poverty are and will continue to be disproportionately affected by these negative events.

Here be our dragons in what for many of us feels like a new world of constant unrest. How do we navigate a way through this uncharted global space swimming with uncertainty? Does the way forward entail avoiding our dragons or facing them? How do we care for ourselves and others in the process? And how do we reckon with the reality that, for many of our neighbors, "constant unrest" has, in fact, long been the norm?

Uncertainty, especially in the context of loss and suffering, can create a high level of anxiety around what will happen to us and those we love. And, like any form of stress, anxiety can take a toll on us physically, emotionally, and spiritually. More specifically, spiritual anxiety arises around who we are in general and who we are in relation to God in particular—around how we are connected to God. This existential anxiety can evoke in persons of faith what pastoral theologian Allan Hugh Cole Jr. calls the *disquieted soul*, for whom, he says, "of central importance are one's assumptions about God, perceptions of oneself standing before God, and the difference those make in how one's personal life story takes shape and is lived."[5]

Ever since March 2020, when the world as many knew it suddenly had to make room for a deadly new virus, I have returned again and again to Mark 16:8. Here, having just been told that Jesus is no longer in the tomb but has been raised, Mary, Mary, and Salome are, Mark says, *terrified and amazed*. Terror and amazement are two sides of the same coin, and fear and uncertainty can invoke both in us. Uncertainty is the very reason we have a fear reflex. At its most helpful, fear can alert our attention to the real dangers in the unknown. Fear is also the feeling we are likely to have when God beckons us toward something new and life-giving. Most of us, like the women standing at the empty tomb, tremble in the face of what we don't know.

Journeys that we make into the unknown, whether brought about by the illness of COVID-19, unemployment, activism, or caring for others during the pandemic, can also be where we encounter the mysteries of God, the convictions of our moral center, and our deepest longings and love for God, self, and others. Unfolding moments of challenge and opportunity such as these require that we (re)form pastors and other spiritual care providers

with an emotional and spiritual flexibility for navigating the urgent uncertainties of our time in ways that will cultivate long-term resilience. As people of faith, we believe in a redeeming God of love and justice whom we trust will always be at work in the world and upon whom we can rely to help us navigate whatever is in front of us. Yet personal and collective crises can test precisely this belief, introduce doubt and anxiety into the life of faith, and leave us at a spiritual crossroads.

One of the strongest and most difficult impulses my students learning pastoral care struggle to rein in is that of *fixing*. Like sailors on European ships sent to conquer foreign lands, students attempt to conquer the crisis unfolding *for* the one to whom they offer care. For students, this impulse typically takes form in an effort to chart a path to *doing* something by which they can measure their efficacy as pastor or chaplain. It is a reflex in response to the anxiety that emerges when faced with suffering and the uncertainty it brings—and one that threatens to diminish the agency of those to whom we offer care. The fact that uncertainty, especially in the context of loss and suffering, can create a high level of anxiety should not come as a surprise—especially to those of us who have been through tragedy, grief, illness, or other events that have opened a chasm into the unknown of our own lives. Anxiety by its very nature can be an egocentric perspective, a self-focused concern for survival. And this inward turn, in the moment, can hinder our ability to engage empathetically with others. For pastoral caregivers, losing our ability to empathize because we have slipped into an anxiety-driven fix-it mode reduces our ability to provide good care. In the extreme, it can jeopardize healthy boundaries, creating a space fraught with danger. This is no less true for anyone else.

We have long clung to a Western colonialist framework, absorbed into our public, professional, and personal lexicon, of charting courses, setting trajectories, and mapping the way forward. Yet moving forward in this historical moment as individuals and caregivers requires a new way of choosing each new step, which will only then inform us about the next. The strategy of imposing order on chaos by mapping or charting our way through it is of little use here. Here, I invite us to shift the metaphors we use for how we go about navigating challenge. I suggest that instead of relying on any notion we might have of finding a clear and direct path through difficulty, we lean into a model of *spiritual and emotional wayfinding* that relies more on

community and on reading our environment and the unfolding realities as we encounter them.

Wayfinding

In her engaging book *Wayfinding: The Science and Mystery of How Humans Navigate the World*, M. R. O'Connor takes a closer look at the science of human spatial navigation.[6] She reminds us that even before the onset of digital maps and directional devices, the idea of overlaying a map to chart a territory had a deep history in colonialism. Uncharted landscapes were long considered "undiscovered" by colonial powers and thus free for the conquering, at the expense, of course, of indigenous peoples. Not surprisingly, as suggested above, this cultural philosophy of *conquering the landscape* has been easily transferred to other nongeographical notions of navigating—with much the same expectation of control and expediency. We speak of "charting a path" to success or "mapping our trajectory" toward achieving a larger personal or professional goal. This preference for expediency and control reflects a deeply ingrained culture of economy in which efficiency of time is the greatest value and the only goal is to reach the final destination. However, to focus only on the destination diminishes our practice of paying attention to our place along the journey and the ways the journey can bring meaning to our lives.

This leads us to the second notion of navigation, which is quite different—that of *wayfinding*. Wayfinding is the complex process of spatial navigation using memory and natural signs in the surrounding environment to "read" an area in order to orient oneself in a given direction. Indigenous persons around the globe are perhaps the most adept at practicing wayfinding. But anyone who has grown up in the back woods, in the mountains, or perhaps on a ranch or farm may have some sense of what I mean here. The essence of wayfinding includes deep knowing, belonging, community, and embracing the story of oneself in the world around one—on the land's terms, not one's own.

Chad Kālepa Baybayan was a Pwo navigator who lead a project to circumnavigate the Pacific Ocean in five years using a traditional Hawaiian voyaging canoe and wayfinding as his sole means of navigation.[7] For him, wayfinding was not only about using the natural environment for clues rather than navigating with instruments. Baybayan described wayfinding

holistically as a way of organizing the world.[8] I find this concept of wayfinding to be fundamental for understanding how to move spiritually and emotionally through an ocean of uncertainty such as surrounds us now. Jesus used his life and ministry to prepare the disciples and other followers, including us, to see that the life of the Spirit moves more fluidly than the world. Theologian Brian Brock reminds us that our task as people of faith is to "learn to recognize the voice and claim of the living God in our daily lives."[9] Brock says, "[I]f faith is a wayfinding—a necessarily sequential discovery of life with God—there is no map that can tell us where our life is going."[10]

Touchstones

Navigating through the uncertain "territories" of life is, of course, an ongoing challenge for all of us. The last two decades of my work with refugees, though, has instilled in me a particular respect for how resilient some people can be in the face of crisis and challenge. Whether making their way through dangerous territory while fleeing from violence or negotiating for food and shelter in a refugee camp or traversing the complex process of resettlement and acculturation in a new country, refugees must be flexible and always ready to respond to challenges as they unfold in front of them. Their resilience has shown me that not having a map or chart to define one's path through difficulty does not mean that one is left to flail about in despair. Indeed, the lessons I have learned from refugees have shaped the core spiritual values I find now to be essential, values that can serve as touchstones to guide us as we recalibrate to the shifting realities that challenge our way forward.

Instead of marking a predetermined linear course, we lean toward these touchstones time and again to reassess and realign. Strengthening our connection to these spiritual values can build in us emotional and spiritual flexibility in the face of increasingly perilous times. These spiritual values are deeply Christian though not exclusively so. They are not passive. They require ongoing practice and build one upon the other in ways that make them so closely intertwined at times as to render them inseparable. Though there certainly are others that we could add, the spiritual values I suggest here are hope, joy, and meaning. I choose these three with an eye toward the ways that hope opens the future to possibility, joy can reflect a

heart surrendered to God, and meaning making can open the way to finding the place of our own journey within God's larger narrative of love in the world, especially through the life, death, and resurrection of Jesus.

Love, rather than standing as a single spiritual value, is the foundation from which the others flow. These values are the expression of the love ethic that is the gospel message itself. In the paradoxical way that is the gospel's, love is both starting point and ultimate end from which and to which God calls us. This love resists becoming trite and thin when we are honest about the messy reality of what it means to live in a world shaped by power, inequality, violence, and despair—and yet not only still believe in a love ethic but *demand* that we hold to its presence and truth.

Hope

The idea that hope emerges only amid positive experiences is a faulty one, though it is true that hope is perhaps easier to envision in times of pleasure and joy or the promise thereof. We hope for a new job, for a pay raise, for the wedding to go off without a hitch, or for any other more tangible outcome. Anyone who has ever faced suffering, illness, or their own death or that of a loved one understands that there are hopes yet more dear to us. Yet even here we should not limit our vision of what hope can be. Spiritual hope requires that we recalibrate how we understand both hope itself and meaning making and how we come to shape them and be shaped by them.

I have recently been reacquainted with the term "radical hope" and find myself wondering, Is not *all* hope radical to some degree? If we take into account the true finite nature of what it is to be human, is it not radical just to presume to look toward any future horizon with a posture of confidence and expectation? It was, of course, Easter 2020when the Mark 16 passage took on a new significance for me, at the very time when Christians revisit the empty tomb. So many of us were trying to remain hopeful in the face of what was quite literally unthinkable. The smell of death and gut-wrenching grief were shockingly real for far too many on this particular Eastertide. Yes, Jesus has risen. I imagined Mary, Mary, and Salome hearing this news and standing at a threshold that they cannot yet define. On one side is the familiar though devastating grief wrapped around the death of their beloved Jesus. On the other side lies a horizon of hope that they cannot yet fully understand and that leaves them both amazed and terrified. This

is a radical hope because it embraces, rather than denies or stifles, the terror of the moment. It is no less so every time each one of us looks toward our own future hopes through the shadow of the cross and its promise for us.

The idea that hope is, by inclination, future oriented is nothing new. I will tell anyone who will sit long enough to listen of my appreciation for pastoral theologian Andrew Lester's work on hope. He helps us think about "future stories" that point toward both finite hopes (tangible needs, health, etc.) and transfinite hopes, those transcendent hopes upon which our faith depends as ways to understand the narratives of hope that sustain us.[11] Lester acknowledges that while hope is psychologically an individual disposition, it is difficult to sustain outside of community. Drawing on Erik Erikson, Lester links the capacity to hope to one's belief in the world's trustworthiness as an outgrowth of the basic trust developed in the infant in the context of a dependable and loving caregiver. Such a basic trust, Lester says, "provides a head start on believing in a God who is present, cares for them, and is concerned about what happens to them."[12] However, for people of color, refugees, immigrants, and those living in poverty, all the parental love or self-confidence one might develop does not necessarily equate to belief in the trustworthiness of the world.

In white, and particularly affluent, communities, hope is often an embodied expectation of the well-lived life. Even for those living in the face of hopelessness, it is against a backdrop that says we should expect to be hopeful. For persons of color, however, hope may come *in spite of* all expectations. Black and brown communities the world over have known a great deal more about the actual distance between hope and its realization when one lives in a world of violence and oppression. From these voices there is undoubtedly much to learn about hope in a world of uncertainty.

In their work on the psychopolitical well-being of marginalized communities, counseling psychologist and Black Lives Matter activist Della V. Mosley and coauthors suggest that *radical hope* includes being attuned, in each moment, to the past *and* the future—particularly as these relate to histories of oppression and resistance for persons of color.[13] Every act of hope brings forward the wisdom of our ancestors who even today in this present moment bind us to their courage in order to create meaning and hope for change in the future. It is this sense of simultaneity—being able to orient oneself in multiple directions at the same time—and, even more so, the connection to how our ancestors navigated through difficulty that can in-

form our own wayfinding through challenging times and that is of particular interest to us here and bears relevance to theological ideas of hope. The idea that as believers we hold a common community of ancestors in faith, as seen in the sacred texts and movements for social justice upon which we must depend as readily as we do the God who beckons us forward, is fundamental to hope as the theological touchstone that will help us recalibrate our wayfinding through crisis.

Bryana H. French and coauthors connect the idea of radical hope to radical healing in racialized communities. "Hope," they suggest, "allows for a sense of agency to change things for the greater good—a belief that one can fight for justice and that the fight will not be futile."[14] Mosley and her colleagues similarly suggest that it is agency *and* faith that "help to maintain a belief that change is not only possible but that individuals can enact [that] change."[15] When pastoral caregivers who surrender to the fixing impulse either consciously or unconsciously believe it is their job to make or provide hope for someone, they foreclose the sense of the other's agency—which, in turn, ultimately forecloses hope.[16] Caregivers can, however, model hope and accompany others on a sacred journey of wayfinding.

We can, and should, remind others and ourselves that we are not helpless in our efforts to shape hope no matter the circumstance. Theologian Susan Nelson suggests hope is found in the "eschatological imagination" that gives rise to those acts, large and small, that open the future.[17] Hope and certainty are not precursors to action.[18] Even in the face of great despair, each act of kindness, love, care, generosity, defiance, or resistance that refuses to let suffering and evil have the last word is the very essence of hope. For Mosley, this looks like resistance that brings faith and agency together through acts of activism that break open the possibility of change.[19]

Standing at the empty tomb, the women are watching the future break open through Jesus's act of love in the face of suffering and violence. As a touchstone, hope enhances spiritual wayfinding by grounding us in the communities of our sacred texts and movements while also reminding us that uncertainty is the place where the mystery of the sacred guides us toward a horizon of possibility.

JOY

It's entirely possible that I include joy here as a spiritual value simply because I think we need more joy in a world so full today of vitriol and hate-mongering. I suppose I should also admit to being shortsighted on the necessity of cultivating joy as an end goal of pastoral caregiving. I have often viewed joy as more akin to happiness, that is, as a fleeting emotion dependent to a large degree upon external circumstances. As such, joy seemed antithetical to suffering, the place where ministry expends so much of its care practice. But the relationship between joy and suffering is much more complex.

I am grateful to Mary Clark Moschella for inspiring in me the notion that joy is an essential touchstone for caregiving, especially when navigating times of crisis and uncertainty. Moschella points to the sustained quality of joy and shows that joy and suffering are not antithetical at all. She describes (rather than defines) joy as

> [a]n embodied awareness of holy presence and extravagant love, an awareness that dawns upon us like grace. It carries a sense of the unexpected, of surprise. The experience of joy is something intensely felt, perceived as an ancient memory bubbling up from deep inside even while it also feels given, from some great beyond, an experience so unexpected and profound that one can only try to take it in. At the same time, joy leaves a lasting impression, one that comes to the surface just as grief does, in the most ordinary of days. The experience of joy is not fleeting or shallow, but deep and striking. It is linked to some object of goodness or wonder.[20]

Another helpful voice in uncovering the deeper meanings of joy is pastoral theologian Greg Ellison. In a conversation with colleague Georgette Ledgister, Ellison describes joy as an inbreaking force with a disruptive character—it "disrupts" our lives and forever changes how we see the world in ways that dislodge despair and that make room for the sacred.[21] It is this disruptive character of joy that allows us to lean into joy even in the midst of great suffering and turbulence, such as the times in which we are living. What better time than during the grief and fear of a pandemic, the despair and anxiety of financial loss, or the violent and traumatic encounters with oppression for persons of color for all of us to realize the invigorating and disrupting power of joy? Instead of asking how one can talk about joy at a

time like this, we might better ask how a joy-filled soul can energize all of us toward recovery, care, and justice.

Cultivating a Disposition of Joy and Gratitude

Joy once nurtured can become a *spiritual disposition* in the lives of the faithful. How do we cultivate this spiritual disposition of joy? To cultivate, from the Latin *colere*, means to live in or to inhabit, to promote growth. Any of these, but particularly the idea of inhabiting, is what I imagine most in connection to joy. Can we cultivate joy in such a way that we *inhabit* the spiritual discipline? Ellison and Moschella both highlight that the inbreaking of God is a central characteristic found in moments of joy. We can attribute this divine inbreaking to the ways joy can *reorient* our perspective, especially over the long term, *reinvigorate* our convictions, and *redefine* how we see the world and how joy reclaims us.[22] As a spiritual disposition, it is joy that brings vitality and vibrancy—life force and energy—to our encounters in the world, especially in the face of hardship, tragedy, and struggle and the uncertainty they bring.

Joy can and should be cultivated. Moschella says,

> Experiences of joy, when explored more fully, offer avenues for a deeper understanding of God's goodness and love. When we are attentive and aware of God's presence in us and all creation, when we feel the joy of this firsthand, we are freed from the paralysis of fear or despair, if only temporarily. Moments like this, when they accumulate over time, strengthen and steady us, and teach us what is good, help us know what well-being looks and feels like."[23]

The practice of cultivating joy has as its goal both depth and endurance, both of which can deepen our own spiritual resources with which we navigate life in difficult times and shape the care practices with which we accompany others through the same.

When joy becomes a spiritual disposition, a touchstone, it spurs us closer to the transcendent view of any circumstance without undermining the severity or seriousness therein. It undergirds a particular perspective that allows room for possibility and helps us lean more readily toward hope. Joy is a deeply felt inner condition that need not be outwardly expressed to fulfill its purpose, but how much more, indeed, does it flourish when shared.

How do pastoral caregivers and others find the way to the spiritual value of joy? The simplest and sometimes most difficult path is gratitude. Like practices of meditation, small movements toward thankfulness can crack open the possibility of remarkable change even if it falls shy of joy in the beginning. A practice of reorienting toward the good opens the heart and mind to thankfulness. Gratitude even in small doses can help us recalibrate our responses to everyday challenges and frustrations or even deep despair. The women in the Gospel of Mark are only able to feel grief and fear—they do not yet understand that the empty tomb is the very place of joy and gratitude. But we do.

Meaning Making

Meaning making is fundamental to an individual's ability to square the sometimes tragic events of this world with a sovereign and personal God who wishes for us every good and peaceable thing. What is meaning making and how do we engage it? Crystal Park, whose research focuses on psychology and spirituality, conducted an extensive literature review of research on meaning making. She describes a surprisingly consistent set of tenets that define the process of meaning making, including the following: (a) people possess orienting systems that provide cognitive frameworks for interpreting their experiences (global meaning); (b) when experiences conflict with these orienting systems, people "appraise the situation and assign meaning to them"; (c) the degree to which the appraised and global meanings differ determines the level of distress experienced; (d) this distress initiates a process of meaning making, which is the individual's attempt to reduce this discrepancy and "restore a sense of the world as meaningful and their own lives as worthwhile." When successful, this process leads to better overall adjustment to the stressful event that was experienced.[24]

It is not enough to simply *have* a framework for interpreting our experience. Colonialist history and ongoing oppressive systemic practices show us how fixed meaning frameworks often serve to sustain the privileging of some at the expense of others. As noted previously, these types of frameworks require a high degree of control, such as charting and mapping, as a way to contain the unknown. To navigate even the everyday uncertainties of life, let alone those of deep crisis, meaning making requires a flexible framework for understanding experiences that allow us to adapt and inte-

grate new experiences as they unfold. This is meaning making that leads to growth and even wisdom.

While describing a step-by-step process helps our overall understanding of meaning making, the lived experience of facing a crisis and trying to make sense of it does not lend itself to a neatly prescribed process. It's messy. A bird's-eye view of an individual's experience over a lifetime would likely reveal multiple and repeated opportunities to engage in the meaning-making process. Opportunity is a key word here. As anyone in ministry can attest, individuals do not always choose or have the skills to navigate their way out of despair even when it is possible to do so. Jesus understood this. We won't stumble upon meaning, nor can it be given to us. Meaning must be made.

Making meaning as a theological touchstone invites us to interpret our experience through a spiritual frame while not ignoring science and logic. By doing so, we are able to see beyond our particular circumstances while not ignoring the reality of them. This meaning making asks of us that we not only seek to understand how God is present in our unfolding story but also asks us to find where *our* story fits in to the larger narrative of God's redeeming love and justice. Do we find our own story in that of the women staring in fear at the empty tomb and wondering what it might mean? This shift of perspective often makes us keenly aware that, whatever our experience or however great the uncertainty, it is not a new story. Our sacred texts are overflowing with others who have faced the same. Two things are sure: our stories are just as important as those which have come before, and God is still bigger than them all.

The soul-aching questions of *Why me?* or *What kind of God would do or allow this?* may well be reasonable queries to make when sitting in the aftermath of grief, loss, or other crises. These are certainly questions we see over and again in the biblical narrative. These questions are sure clues that the meaning-making process is underway. We should not, though, confuse the importance of the meaning-making process with the need to find sure answers. Pastors and chaplains must remember that even as we go about the imperfect process of trying to answer the difficult questions around suffering and loss, it is even more important that we learn to live with unanswered questions. Pastoral theologian John Swinton in his discussion about pastoral responses to evil reminds us, "What we need is not an answer to the question of why God allows evil, but rather an ability to live with unan-

swered questions and still retain faith in the goodness of God and the hope of God's providential promises."[25] Finding one's way to a lived theology that allows this level of ambiguity requires that we seek meaning outside of certitude.

Though we have come last to meaning as a touchstone, we have in a sense been working on it from the beginning. The theological touchstones as a whole are a part of the frame by which we as people of faith make sense of our experience—joy and hope are essential to this frame. Spiritual wayfinding requires that we see that each is deeply interconnected with the other.

Finding the Way

Those in ministries of all sorts, but especially pastors and chaplains, have the honor of standing with the women in Mark—with those at the threshold where the empty tomb opens into possibility. Likewise, we accompany individuals and communities as we wayfind through these times of uncertainty. We move toward the possibility promised by the empty tomb, returning again and again to the spiritual touchstones to recalibrate and reinvigorate us on the journey. With each return to the touchstones, we ground ourselves in hopeful futures with embodied joy as meaning-making people of faith claiming our place in the ongoing story of God's love in the world. It is our sacred task.

The scandal of the gospel, as I am surely not the first to note, is that through the love of Christ, we see the world differently. We can believe in love even when all evidence is to the contrary. We *hope* even when it seems hopeless. Hope is when love gives us the vision to imagine what is possible despite circumstances. It becomes the horizon toward which to move. We find *joy* even in the face of suffering. Joy is rooted in the practiced remembering of God's love for "me," even if it is experienced as the outward expression of gratitude through acts of altruism or giving to others. Further, we can make meaning even in the face of the senseless. Meaning making occurs when love of God is the lens through which we seek to make sense of our experience in the world. We dare to engage justice even in the face of powers and principalities actively and sometimes violently resisting us. Justice is love of other, love in action on behalf of the oppressed. We can find *resilience* even as the pain continues, not only in its absence. Resilience

is God's persistent love that becomes the strongest resource in our ability to struggle well in the face of ambiguity. When we are certain of God's love, the uncertainty around us becomes more tolerable.

To those who would say such notions of hope, joy, and meaning (and love) are thin and trite, I invite them to show me any other way, not only when the world seems sure but even when it is turned upside down.

NOTES

1 Gregory Heyworth, director of the Lazarus Project at the University of Rochester, has created a 3D model of the original globe, which is on display at the New York Public Library. Kathleen McGarvey, "One of the World's Oldest Globes Is Ready for Its Close-Up," University of Rochester Newscenter, Feb. 26, 2020, https://www.rochester.edu/newscenter/worlds-oldest-globe-hunt-lenox-lazarus-project-417532/.

2 Shirin Elahi, "Here Be Dragons . . . Exploring the 'Unknown Unknowns,'" *Futures* 43, no. 2 (March 2011): 196–201.

3 The Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) recently issued its *Sixth Assessment Report*. The evidence is clear, the planet is warming more quickly than anticipated. Even with an immediate reduction in emissions, the impact of climate warming will continue to accelerate for decades to come. Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change, *AR6 Synthesis Report: Climate Change 2022*, https://www.ipcc.ch/assessment-report/ar6/.

4 Deaths caused by injury include death by drowning, transport accidents (especially alcohol- related driving accidents), falls, assaults, and suicide. Bobbie M. Parks et al., "Anomalously Warm Temperatures Are Associated with Increased Injury Deaths," *Nature Medicine* 26 (January 2020): 65–70, www.nature.com/naturemedicine.

5 Allan Hugh Cole Jr., *Be Not Anxious: Pastoral Care of Disquieted Souls* (Grand Rapids, MI: Wm. B. Eerdmans, 2008), 25.

6 M. R. O'Connor, *Wayfinding: The Science and Mystery of How Humans Navigate the World* (New York: St. Martin's Press, 2019).

7 See Polynesian Voyaging Society: Moananuiaka—A Voyage for the Pacific. www.hokulea.com/moananuiakea/.

8 "Hokule'a: The Art of Wayfinding (Interview with a Master Navigator)," National Geographic blog, March 3, 2014; San Low, "Chad Baybayan, " Hawaiian Voyaging Traditions, http://archive.hokulea.com/index/founder_and_teachers/chad_baybayan.html

9 Brian Brock, "Discipleship as Living with God, or Wayfinding and Scripture," *Journal of Spiritual Formation & Soul Care*, 7, no. 1 (2014): 22–34.

10 Brock, "Discipleship as Living with God."

11 Andrew Lester, *Hope in Pastoral Care and Counseling* (Louisville: Westminster John Knox Press, 1995), 64.

12 Lester, *Hope in Pastoral Care and Counseling*, 96

13 Della V. Mosley et al., "Radical hope in Revolting Times: Proposing a Culturally Relevant Psychological Framework," *Social and Personality Psychology Compass* 14, no. 1 (January 2020), e12512, https://doi.org/10.1111/spc3.12512.

14 Bryana H. French et al., "Toward a Psychological Framework of Radical Healing in Communities of Color," *The Counseling Psychologist* 48, no. 1 (2020): 14-46, 26, https://doi.org/10.1177/0011000019843506.

15 Mosley et al., "Radical Hope," 5.

16 While we can offer visions of hope, particularly in relation to God's persistent presence, grace, and love, we cannot make others hope. They must claim hope for themselves.

17 Susan L. Nelson, "Facing Evil: Evil's Many Faces, Five Paradigms for Understanding Evil," *Interpretation* 57, no. 4 (2003), 398–413. https://doi.org/10.1177%2F002096430005700405.

18 Pastoral theologian Ryan LaMothe notes numerous everyday acts of passionate and courageous caring that accompany life situations that, indeed, seem quite hopeless. Writing in the context of the reality of the climate peril we face, LaMothe suggests that feelings of hopelessness are no excuse for inaction. Ryan LaMothe, *A Radical Political Theology for the Anthropocene Age: Thinking and Being Otherwise* (Eugene, OR: Cascade Books, 2021), 283.

19 Mosley et al., "Radical Hope," 6.

20 Mary Clark Moschella, "Calling and Compassion: Elements of Joy in Lived Practices of Care," in *Joy and Human Flourishing: Essays on Theology, Culture, and the Good Life*, ed. Miroslav Volf and Justin E. Crisp (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2015), 99. See also Mary Clark Moschella, *Caring for Joy: Narrative, Theology, and Practice* (Leiden: Brill, 2016).

21 Yale Youth Ministry Institute, "Rev. Dr. Greg Ellison and Georgette Ledgister on Joy," YouTube video, 12:17, https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=znpPjk5nVww&t=79s

22 Yale Youth Ministry Institute, "Rev. Dr. Grego Ellison."

23 Moschella, "Calling and Compassion," 107.

24 Crystal L. Park, "Making Sense of the Meaning Literature: An Integrative Review of Meaning Making and Its Effects on Adjustment to Stressful Life Events," *Psychological Bulletin* 136, no. 2 (2010): 257–301.

25 John Swinton, *Raging with Compassion: Pastoral Responses to the Problem of Evil* (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2007), 47.