

Vocational Discernment and the Nurture of Pastoral Imagination in Female Interns at Tyndale Seminary

Marilyn Draper, Yau Man Siew, Lisa Pak, and Michael Krause¹

INTRODUCTION

As a trans denominational school, Tyndale Seminary supports women in pastoral roles and ministry leadership positions. The Academic Calendar states the faculty “are fully committed to supporting women who sense God’s calling into the full scope of ministry responsibilities, including the ordained ministries of the church.”¹ Support is particularly necessary due to the growing number of female students applying and enrolling; in January 2021, 58% of the student body was female.² With this growth, there is a pressing need to provide opportunities for female pastoral interns to discern their vocational call and be equipped with practical ministry skills through the Tyndale Seminary Internship Program (TSIP), the capstone course in field education.

A Lilly Foundation Grant enabled three Tyndale professors and a DMin candidate, who served as project manager, to explore how the TSIP could better support and encourage female pastoral interns as they engaged in and reflected upon ministry practice.³ To this end, we interviewed five female pastoral interns who reported a positive field experience, along with their supervisors, to better understand what encouraged those seminarians to flourish and discern their vocational call. We explored five relationships essential for the cultivation of the craft of pastoral ministry: knowledge formation – student/classroom; leadership formation – student/supervisor; ministry formation – student/congregation; theological reflection formation – student/Spirit; and vocational formation – student/self.⁴ We reflected on these specific areas to gain insight into what made the internship experiences meaningful. The broader goal is to devise a plan for continued development of the TSIP, ensuring that future female seminarians will develop vocational discernment and nurture pastoral imagination.

Marilyn Draper is Assistant Professor of Practical Theology, Yau Man Siew is Associate Professor of Practical Theology, Lisa Pak is Project Manager of Tyndale Nurturing Pastoral Imagination Study 2021, and Michael Krause is RJ Bernardo Family Chair of Leadership, Doctor of Ministry Leadership Track Coordinator, and Associate Professor of Practical Theology at Tyndale Seminary of Tyndale University, Toronto, Ontario. Email: mdraper@tyndale.ca.

Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry
ISSN 2325-2847 (print)* ISSN 2325-2855 (online)

© Copyright 2023 *Reflective Practice: Formation and Supervision in Ministry*
All Rights Reserved

PASTORAL IMAGINATION

Field education is formative in the vocational discernment and pastoral imagination of seminarians because the experience encourages students to question their own assumptions, reflect deeply on their tradition, and develop new ways of thinking and responding within ministry situations as they gain insight into their own call to ministry.⁵ Craig Dykstra developed the concept of pastoral imagination, describing a “set of sensibilities, virtues, and skills that characteristically belongs to good pastors.”⁶ Pastoral imagination is the embodiment of the pastoral leadership gift given by God’s Spirit, honed into the life rhythms and ministry practices of the congregational minister.

In 2008, Eileen Campbell-Reid and Christopher Scharen started a longitudinal study on the cultivation of pastoral imagination, describing pastoral imagination as “the intangible qualities of pastors who know their work well, embody habits of mind, and enact wisdom through pastoral practices that nurture community and sustain vocational life.”⁷ Campbell-Reid’s *Pastoral Imagination* also highlights significant struggle, or “interruptions to the birth of pastoral imagination,” noting that women across all denominations face challenges finding ministry employment and dealing with traditional expectations.⁸ We wanted to discover how the TSIP developed the vocational call of female seminarians and nurtured their pastoral imagination. As well, we looked for indications of challenges they encountered.

TYNDALE SEMINARY INTERNSHIP PROGRAM

The TSIP is required of seminarians in the master of divinity (MDiv) program. While our counselling and spiritual direction students take internships specific to their qualifications, other seminarians are invited to apply for CPE, a placement in their own congregational setting, or a placement through the TSIP network. The site can be in a congregation, Christian organization, or a chaplaincy setting. When students complete a minimum 15 of the 27 courses in the MDiv program, they enroll in the eight-month, two semester TSIP internship, which includes 10 hours each week for a total of 260-plus hours of hands-on ministry experience. The interns meet once a week for an hour with a ministry supervisor, basing their conversations and activities on an individual learning covenant created in partnership with their site leader and course professor. Interns accompany their supervisors to meetings and watch them in a variety of tasks. As well, students undertake appropriate leadership roles within the setting. Approximately once a month, the interns meet in small groups with the course professor to reflect theologically on the internship experience through presentation, discussion, and creation of case studies emerging from the internship setting. The course ends with the students writing a substantial reflective paper on their philosophy of ministry to integrate the internship with their classroom and seminary experience.

Tyndale is diverse in its denominational composition, with over forty denominations represented. Situated in Toronto, one of the most ethnically diverse cities in the world, Tyndale has students from over sixty cultural groups. Further, the age range includes students in their early twenties to those in their seventies. While this study does not focus on this diversity, the variety of internships and the variety of students remain an important factor in the background of the study. Participants in the study were Chinese, Black, and White.

RESEARCH: PHILOSOPHICAL FRAMEWORK AND METHODOLOGY

Theoretical paradigms framed our research method. We used appreciative inquiry, a cooperative methodology that embeds storytelling as part of the research journey, because we wanted to learn from positive cases, including why they were successful.⁹ We also employed qualitative research, adopting “inductive reasoning to seek meaning, understanding or explanation from the data.”¹⁰ To this end, we selected five female pastoral interns who offered information-rich cases.¹¹ The women in this study were all moving toward a second career; four were in congregational settings and one was in a chaplaincy context. Two sites involved economically challenged communities.

While these five cases cannot be generalized to larger populations, “case study research” remains a valid method to gain in-depth understanding into a given phenomenon.¹² Thomas notes that a case is not selected based upon a representative sample but rather because it is interesting, unusual, and striking.¹³ Yin highlights that a case study assists when we are eager to answer the questions of “how” and “why” in circumstances where we cannot influence the behavior of those involved in a study and when we want to cover contextual conditions that may be relevant to the phenomenon under study.¹⁴ The data from this research study provides insight into what made these internships fulfilling for our female pastoral interns.

After a successful review by the Research Ethics Board of Tyndale Seminary, we proceeded with the interviews, which were carried out over a video conferencing platform and recorded with the permission of the participants. All interviews began with a review of the purpose of the study, an assurance of confidentiality, and a reminder that the data would be stored for three years. The 45-minute interviews were semi-structured and narrative in style to create a comfortable dynamic where the participants could share honestly and openly, allowing us to pursue and probe areas for clarification.

Throughout the research process, we sought to strengthen the internal validity of the study. First, during our numerous research team meetings, we discussed design, research questions, analysis, potential codes, and emerging themes; all have potential to generate more reliable results.¹⁵ Questions were designed around the five formational areas already mentioned: knowledge formation – student/classroom; leadership formation – student/supervisor; ministry formation – student/congregation; theological

reflection formation – student/Spirit; and vocational formation – student/self. Second, we implemented a data audit, grounding the findings in the breadth and depth of the transcript data as the transcripts were reviewed independently by each member of the research team. This reduces misinterpretations or biases by providing diverse perspectives on the data.¹⁶ Third, we used low inference descriptors in our report by inserting periodic accounts in participants’ own words rather than rephrasing their thoughts and opinions.¹⁷ In our assessment, we also include a section on acceptance of women in leadership because the topic emerged in discussions concerning leadership and congregational interaction but did not fall neatly into one of our designated areas.

As a further note, we conducted the research during the COVID-19 pandemic. One internship finished just before the pandemic. Three of the internships began prior to but ended during the COVID-19 pandemic. Two other internships were completed in their entirety during the pandemic. While this certainly affected the internship experience, we were still able to address the purpose of our study.

Knowledge Formation – Student/Classroom

Interns told us that practical courses preparing them for “real-life ministry experiences” (including leadership development, administration, and curriculum planning) were particularly beneficial in bridging the gap between the classroom and the ministry context. Biblical studies and exegesis courses were important for teaching and preaching experiences.

Supervisors, understandably, had limited knowledge of the Tyndale curriculum; however, they all recognized that the students strove to make the connection from the classroom to the ministry context. They were all grateful for the TSIP, and some supervisors had their own additional internship curriculum to complement the program. Both interns and supervisors identified gaps where the classroom and church ministry could more closely connect. One intern stated that “[r]eal life and theory in class don’t [match up]” and wished she had taken more courses on the practical side of ministry. She named needed skills such as organizing one’s day, bookkeeping, running a meeting, and budgeting. Another intern remarked that she would “love to see” more panel discussions, in and outside the classroom on subjects that focused on working in a congregation. Other interns echoed desires for practical courses that prepared students for church ceremonies (weddings and funerals) and how better to connect preaching to contemporary life. They also called for courses that introduced them to different models of ministries, traditions, and theologies, hinting that Tyndale, with its diversity, is well positioned to expose students to a broad range of models and traditions. Interns also mentioned their desire to discuss “heated topics,” such as pastoral care in the LGBTQ+ community, women in ministry, and mental health. They wanted to be equipped to minister beyond their own contextual paradigms.

On the specific subject of women in ministry, one supervisor strongly suggested that all students, not only female students, be thoroughly equipped with an apologetic to enable them to intelligently and confidently articulate support for women in leadership when facing opposition. This supervisor encouraged “a clear opportunity to study the literature related to the interpretation of biblical texts” because “an apologetic would give women ammunition” in what the supervisor observed was becoming a more hostile environment for women leaders in many congregations. Although Tyndale offers a course titled *Women and Men in Ministry*, few males enroll.

Other supervisors also suggested exposure to a wider variety of models of ministry and ecumenical traditions. One supervisor urged a broader spectrum of internship opportunities and exposure to the larger family of Christian ministry outside evangelical sites. In one chaplaincy internship, both the intern and the supervisor highlighted that nontraditional sites offer a broad, unexpected, and full ministry experience.

Finally, in light of the challenges presented by the COVID-19 pandemic, one supervisor suggested TSIP professors create a toolkit for supervisors on how to navigate online mentoring. Currently, Tyndale offers a short training workshop for the supervisors. More thorough training, or additional resources, might assist supervisors, particularly in the development of online internship possibilities.

Leadership Formation – Student/Supervisor

Interns who thrived in their pastoral internship found that their supervisors were welcoming, supportive, honest, encouraging, and intentional. One intern said: “There was an openness, vulnerability, encouragement, and [the supervisor] was very affirming.” She also added that a very poignant moment for her was when her supervisor unequivocally stated, “I’d love for you to bring [intern’s name] to the team.” The supervisor was extending a bold invitation for the student to be fully present and engaged in ministry, claiming her role as pastoral intern.

Similarly, all the interns, without exception, were encouraged to be themselves, and they were given much room to grow. Another intern said: “I really appreciate the fact that [the supervisor] really made me feel welcome and appreciated and that my voice meant something.” One supervisor commented about how they were very intentional about encouraging, even pushing, the intern to claim her own internal authority and capacity, recognizing that the Holy Spirit works differently in new situations.

The supervisors opened doors for the interns to gain access to aspects of church life. When asked about opportunities offered, one intern replied, “Everything, which surprised me, but it was awesome. I attended every meeting and I still do.” Another intern confirmed that her internship opportunities were broad and all-encompassing, sharing that she was given “the breadth of experience . . . I was not held back from any department or any facet.” She added: “The internship itself was wide open, and I think

that's awesome that I wasn't pigeonholed as a woman." In fact, all the female pastoral interns expressed that they had full access and felt welcomed. One intern commented that her ministry context was "an inclusive environment where your gifts and talents are celebrated and [you're] encouraged to stretch." The supervisors opened doors. The interns took the opportunity to explore and fully engage.

Supervisors also provided opportunities to ask and even challenge. One intern described her relationship with her supervisor, saying that the supervisor "shared leadership space," adding that it was a "learning partnership." To this end, all the interns found that they could speak openly, ask questions, and even offer candid feedback to their supervisors without fear or concern for any negative repercussions or consequences. One supervisor shared a personal internship philosophy: "I'll teach you everything I know; I'll take you everywhere I go." In other words, the internship was a place where the intern could ask questions, fail forward, improve, "get their hands and feet dirty," and jump right into the world of ministry. The TSIP offered a prime opportunity for students to experience first-hand the "ministry of presence." The supervisors unanimously agreed that TSIP experiences are extremely significant in the leadership formation of pastor-ministers and the nurture of pastoral imagination.

Supervisors were available and open to conversations with their interns and welcomed the discussion of hard topics, leading to deepening friendships. A significant note is that all the relationships between intern and their supervisor extended beyond the duration of the official internship. Through the TSIP, a real and authentic friendship was forged to provide a helpful resource and friend for the future.

Ministry Formation – Student/Congregation

Two of the five internship experiences occurred entirely during the global COVID-19 pandemic, severely curtailing the interns' opportunity to interact directly with the congregations. Still, interactions over online platforms were formative. Fortunately, both interns had been part of these congregations prior to the pandemic. Pre-existing relationships prevented potential awkwardness that could have occurred if students interned online at a previously unknown site.

The community clearly had a positive and formative impact on one intern, who shared that she had found her "people" and "purpose" in her internship experience. Also of note, another intern (who started her internship before the pandemic) took the initiative to introduce herself to the community several months before her internship began. This really set the stage for her to "hit the ground running" when the internship officially began. She was already known and welcomed by the community as an involved, kind, and sincere person and a familiar face. This particular intern also had the foresight to exit the congregation in a phasing-out process, which her supervisor considered as gracious and kind and reflective of her servant heart for the community she had served.

All supervisors agreed that the role and presence of the community/congregation is important for interns. The two supervisors mentoring the interns whose experiences were couched in the global COVID-19 pandemic lamented that there were limited opportunities for irreplaceable in-person interactions. One supervisor aptly observed: “It’s the congregation, always, that draws out and then affirms the gifting of individuals,” supporting Dykstra’s emphasis on the value of the ministry context in nurturing pastoral imagination.¹⁸

The supervisors observed that the congregations where these interns served were encouraging, affirming, and accepting, adding how grateful the congregation was to the intern for journeying with them. An insightful comment from one of the interns encapsulates the importance of the community in the internship experience: “I am being disciplined by my congregation.” Clearly, the formative experience went both ways: the congregation was served by the intern and the intern was shaped by the congregation.¹⁹

Historical Acceptance of Women in the Interns’ Ministry Contexts

Supervisors provided historical context regarding acceptance of women as spiritual leaders and/or pastors in their congregations. Three of the five ministry contexts had historically not welcomed women as leaders in their faith community. The chaplaincy site was the only one that had always accepted both women and men as pastoral leaders in equal partnership.

The second ministry site had ordained women ministers since 1934. Since the 1970s, there was increasing openness to women serving in the specific leadership roles of deacon and pastor. However, the supervisor commented that congregations in the denomination were permitted to have a more complementarian view, and many congregations had always hired men for the position of senior minister.

At the third internship site, acceptance of female pastoral leaders changed over time. Women were not previously given any significant leadership titles though they did the work that was expected of someone in leadership. By the time of the intern’s arrival, women were fully accepted into leadership roles and given appropriate titles.

At the fourth site, the denomination had moved to a more egalitarian stance. However, members of this congregation lagged behind, continuing to adopt a soft-complementarian view. In contrast, the lead pastor and the intern supervisor, along with several others on staff, were advocates for women leaders, which mitigated the intern’s potential negative experience. Knowing this history, she openly shared that she had to wrestle with the idea of doing her internship in a church that did not recognize women leaders, asking herself, “Do I want to be a part of a church that doesn’t actually see women as equal?” Ultimately, the intern opted to do her internship at this church because the lead pastor and her supervisor were supportive. She also saw this as an opportunity to encourage change: “You have to have people like me in a church who are speaking against those things [soft complementarianism].” However, it is important to note that

although this intern was invited to preach, a male intern was given greater opportunity to develop his preaching skills.

At the final site, the denomination had left the decision of accepting and welcoming women leaders to the individual congregation. The intern served at a congregation that was open and welcoming of women ministers. This situation, therefore, did not negatively affect the internship experience in any notable ways. However, the supervisor did express concern about the dynamics female pastors encounter at denominational gatherings.

In short, the congregations' histories related to women in ministry leadership can impact interns' experiences. While some interns were wary about their congregation's stance, the acceptance, support, and encouragement of their supervisors and congregations made the greater difference and impact. One intern summed up her experience: "So, there's definitely resistance there [at the church polity level], but I never felt that from anybody in my inclusion in what was going on in the church." None of the interns felt that their gender was a barrier because the supervisors offered them freedom and access.

Theological Reflection Formation – Student/Spirit

One of the key objectives of the TSIP is to develop the intern's ability to theologically reflect on their experiences,²⁰ leading to integration of knowledge and also vocational discernment.²¹ TSIP students write two case studies and participate in small group discussions centered on theological reflection with professors and peers. Further reflection takes place during the weekly discussions with their supervisors, who provide reading material and ask reflective questions. For research participants, conversations ranged from "hallway chats" to intentionally set appointments to debriefs with the pastoral team. While the pandemic prevented in-person connections, opportunities for discussion and prayer emerged through online, phone, and other channels of communication.

Students' case studies for TSIP emerge from experiences that do not go as expected or are surprising or disappointing. Such challenging moments are significant in the development and nurturing of pastoral imagination. Campbell-Reid and Scharen emphasize: "It is amid such seeming complications and disruptions that the pastors' role and soul begin to come together."²² Reflections around challenges also result in vocational discernment. One intern shared that theological reflection helped her confront previously held beliefs she did not even realize she had so that she could be more aware of God's Spirit: "It was God's voice. He just knew I needed that additional encouragement to build that confidence into my calling." For the interns, both casual and set conversations with supervisors became significant affirmations from God regarding ministry vocation and calling.

Interns also mentioned they felt God's presence during the internship through the ministry activities in which they engaged. A particularly beautiful portrait was painted by an intern who shared that she distinctly felt God's presence as she sat in the minister's office where so many of the past ministers of that church had studied. She could feel the history. It was a poignant moment of reflection for her. Furthermore, the interns' reflection times during corporate worship, as well as personal Bible reading, were moments when they distinctly felt God's affirmation.

From the supervisors' perspective, the interns were eager to reflect upon and contemplate their ministry experience. One supervisor was particularly encouraged by the intern's questions and willingness for deep discussions in "very nonlinear, philosophical-theological conversations related to ministry." Another supervisor talked about guiding the intern to "reflect on what it means to be a minister and come in to claiming her own capacity and identity as a minister." Thus, the supervisors intentionally addressed theological reflection in relation to vocational call.

Vocational Formation – Student/Self

An important criterion that indicated a positive formative experience for the intern was the emergence of her sense of self in her ministry vocation and calling. This emergence of the sense of self was also evidence of a developing pastoral imagination. Interns expressed growth in their personal calling, self-confidence, and recognition of their giftings. One intern shared a deeper understanding of her identity as "God's beloved daughter." As a result, she emerged more confident as a female pastor serving and using her gifts; she no longer felt a need to defend her pastoral identity. One intern who was in a soft-complementarian ministry context was not deterred from pursuing an internship with this church but rather saw it as an opportunity to enact change by being present and respectfully challenging the status quo. One intern confidently proclaimed that she knew that she was "in purpose"; she found her calling through this internship as her pastoral imagination grew.

Overall, the internship helped identity formation and vocational discernment. One intern admitted to being timid and shy when she started but was encouraged when her supervisor said: "Your spiritual voice is yours." At the end of her internship, she was contemplating ordination, which she had not dared to consider previously. She shared: "I think I'm called. I can't run away. Even if I say, 'I'm not ready, I'm so timid, I can't do that,' but God says, 'I have chosen you, so you have to be a witness.'" She added, "And then this internship really made me think this way . . . they invited me to do this internship in my own church, asking me to stay. This invitation to stay is a call. She was encouraged to claim her calling as a good "fit." All interns expressed a strong sense of affirmation in their pastoral-ministry vocation and will be continuing this vocation in some form.

Supervisors also observed this growth of self-confidence as the interns became more confident and certain of their pastoral-ministry calling when their giftedness was affirmed. One supervisor commented, "I think she came away with a clear conviction." Another observed that the intern developed "a self-confidence and a self-awareness; a self-reception of her call." Confidence in call emerged as the students gained a greater awareness of self along with discernment of God's direction in ministry. Female seminarians appeared unsure of their vocational call until participating in TSIP, thus validating the importance of field education.

FUTURE DIRECTIONS

These five cases were selected because the interns reported rich and transformative internship experiences. Although the results are not generalizable, this in-depth qualitative study provides important insights into vocational discernment and the nurture of pastoral imagination of female pastoral interns as seen through the lens of these five relationships of formation: knowledge-classroom, leadership-supervisors, ministry-congregation, theological reflection-Spirit, and vocation-self. Possible future steps emerge.

First, this study affirms that the TSIP experience is a significant formative experience that links classroom knowledge to real-life ministry situations. The potential exists to expand the TSIP curriculum. Ten hours a week plus monthly classroom discussions with the professor do not provide enough time for integration.²³ Even though the TSIP is a two-semester program, the students only receive one credit from the course. Including a second semester credit could ease students' sense of overload and provide hours to enable further classroom reflection. Also important is that both male and female professors across all disciplines express support for women in ministry and that the seminary continues to validate women in leadership in all aspects of the curriculum. Regular panel discussions that bring challenging topics to the forefront would also enable further integration and encourage students to form pastoral responses to contemporary needs.

Second, the presence of strong, supportive, encouraging, and affirming supervisors was integral in making the female student interns feel welcomed, appreciated, and accepted. The study validated the importance of supervisors who spend time with the students, both providing experiences and interacting with those experiences. Expanding training for supervisors, and the creation of the planned Tyndale Mentoring Network, will help to ensure continued development of this essential part of the TSIP experience.

Third, regardless of their historical position on women in pastoral leadership, the role of the congregation was important in shaping the interns. The dynamics of the congregation shifted with the intern's presence in a positive and inclusive way, and the intern was also shaped by her relationship with the congregation that welcomed her into

their fellowship. Because the congregation has a formative impact, it is important for the field education sites to be carefully chosen. The creation of internship placements at welcoming and flourishing congregations where three or four interns can be placed in community may be the next step in TSIP development. Further, to facilitate an effective onboarding process, a pre-introduction to the ministry context could equip interns by providing familiarity with the setting.

Fourth, a deep connection exists between the nurture of pastoral imagination and theological reflection. Given that there was a lack of common language about theological reflection and pastoral imagination on the part of the interns, practical theology courses could be re-developed to highlight and give further definition to these terms. Interns found theological reflection emerged organically through journaling, peer discussions, prayer times, and, for interns who started before the pandemic, accumulated “hallway” conversations. In the future, TSIP professors might link the internship experience more intentionally to practices students have learned in other courses, such as journaling or communal discernment. The case study model could be expanded to include other courses. Finally, as the students develop their philosophy of ministry for the TSIP final paper, there could be a requirement to theologically reflect on how men and women can work in partnership in congregational leadership.

Fifth, TSIP can continue to support the wider curriculum by highlighting the students’ sense of self and vocational discernment in ministry, helping students to articulate a theology of ministry and how their own strengths fit that participation. Further, students are encouraged to meet with a spiritual director and a counsellor. Insights from these meetings could be more intentionally included in TSIP to assist students in integrating self-awareness into vocational calling.

Professors in the TSIP imagine this study is only a beginning. Discussions are underway to expand the study to more students and engage more diversity of age, denomination, racial context, and program majors. A larger research group would provide opportunities to highlight distinctives and overlapping themes. One possible future study is to interview women pastors and ministry leaders who have been in the ministry for five to ten years. Since the interns in the study were only in the congregations for a short time, it will be important to monitor resistance they might encounter in the future; more seasoned leaders can provide this input. Key questions can also be asked about foundational courses to better prepare female leaders to face the challenges of ministry so that the TSIP will continue to encourage the vocational discernment, flourishing, and nurturing of pastoral imagination.

¹ Tyndale Seminary, Office of the Registrar, Academic Calendars 2021–2022 and 2022–2023.

² Marilyn Draper, *Responding to God's Call: Tyndale Sees Upward Trend in Female Seminarians*, 2021, <https://www.tyndale.ca/news/responding-to-gods-call-tyndale-sees-upward-trend-in-female-seminarians>.

³ Coauthor and DMin candidate Lisa Pak successfully completed her program and graduated with a DMin in leadership in 2022.

⁴ These five relationships emerged as we interacted with field education literature. See Craig Dykstra, "Pastoral and Ecclesial Imagination," in *For Life Abundant: Practical Theology, Theological Education, and Christian Ministry*, ed. Dorothy C. Bass and Craig Dykstra (Grand Rapids, MI: Eerdmans, 2008), 41–61; Kathleen Cahalan, *Introducing the Practice of Ministry* (Collegeville, MN: Liturgical, 2010), x–xi; Eileen Campbell-Reid and Christopher Sharen, "'Holy cow! This stuff is real!' From Imagining Ministry to Pastoral Imagination," *Teaching Theology and Religion* 14, no. 4 (2011): 325; Sung Hee Chung and Matthew Floding (eds.), *Enlighten: Formational Learning in Theological Field Education* (Lanham, MD: Rowman & Littlefield, 2020), 14; Eileen Campbell-Reid, *Pastoral Imagination: Bringing the Practice of Ministry to Life* (Minneapolis: Fortress, 2021), 7–10.

⁵ Chung and Floding, *Enlighten*, 14.

⁶ Dykstra, "Pastoral and Ecclesial Imagination," 50.

⁷ Campbell-Reid and Sharen, "Holy cow!" 325.

⁸ "Women across all the denominations struggled in particular ways regarding gender. They ran into roadblocks, poor assumptions, stereotypes, and implicit and explicit bias." Campbell-Reid, *Pastoral Imagination*, 10.

⁹ David L. Cooperrider and Diana Whitney, *Appreciative Inquiry: A Positive Revolution in Change* (San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler, 2005), 8.

¹⁰ Shirley Williams and Margo Paterson, "A Phenomenological Study of the Art of Occupational Therapy," *The Qualitative Report* 14, no. 4 (2009): 694, <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2009.1374>.

¹¹ Michael Patton, *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*, 4th ed. (Newbury Park, CA: Sage, 2014), 230.

¹² Patton, *Qualitative Evaluation*, 12–13, chapter 5, Module 31; Robert Yin, *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*, 4th ed. (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2009); Adrijana Biba Starman, "The Case Study as a Type of Qualitative Research," *Journal of Contemporary Educational Studies*, 1 (2013): 28–43,

https://www.researchgate.net/publication/265682891_The_case_study_as_a_type_of_qualitative_research/link/54183f560cf25ebee988104c/.

¹³ Gary Thomas, "A Typology for the Case Study in Social Science," *Qualitative Inquiry* 17, no. 6 (2011): 514.

¹⁴ Robert K. Yin, as cited in Pamela Baxter and Susan Jack, "Qualitative Case Study Methodology: Study Design and Implementation for Novice Researchers," *The Qualitative Report* 13, no. 4 (2008): 545. <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2008.1573>.

¹⁵ David Silverman and Amir Marvasti, *Doing Qualitative Research* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2008).

¹⁶ Beth Rodgers, "Audit Trail," in *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research*, vol. 1, ed. Lisa M. Given (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2008), 43–44.

¹⁷ Ronald Chenail, "Conducting Qualitative Data Analysis: Managing Dynamic Tensions Within, Part One" *The Qualitative Report* 17 (2012): 500–5, <https://doi.org/10.46743/2160-3715/2012.2724>.

¹⁸ "As a gift fitting to the pastoral life, the pastoral imagination that comes to ministers is given and received in the midst of a life spent in service to God's people." Dykstra, "Pastoral," 42.

¹⁹ Interns benefit both from mentoring (apprenticeship to a person) and apprenticeship to a situation. Campbell-Reid, *Pastoral Imagination*, 136.

²⁰ "The element of reflection on practice is key to understanding how these moments have come to be identified by the new ministers as significant . . . the birth of pastoral imagination was refracted explicitly through conversation with congregations, peers, and mentors." Campbell-Reid and Scharen, "Holy cow!" 332.

²¹ Campbell-Reid highlights "a kind of integration that happens between who a person is (identity) and what that person does (skill) and what that person knows (knowledge and understanding." Campbell-Reid, *Pastoral Imagination*, 9.

²² Campbell-Reed and Scharen, "Holy cow!" 332.

²³ Campbell Reid, *Pastoral Imagination*, 9.