

The Development of Emotional Intelligence in United Methodist Clergy: An Introductory Investigation

Kristin Langstraat*

Preaching, teaching, church administration, pastoral care skills: these are the classic areas of training for pastors.¹ Clergy provide nurture, build community, teach the basics of faith, and help bring separate individuals together to care for one another. Additionally, ministers are held accountable for *results* in their ministry, often measured through membership, baptisms, budgets, and confessions of faith. It can be argued that pastors cannot perform any of these tasks well without the underlying skills of emotional intelligence (EI).

There are many definitions of EI, yet they all share a similar focus. In their foundational EI research, Mayer, Caruso, and Salovey define EI as a “set of emotional and social skills that influence the way we perceive and express ourselves, develop and maintain social relationships, cope with challenges, and use emotional information in an effective and meaningful way.”² In addition, Daniel Goleman has separated EI into the competencies of self-awareness, self-management, social awareness, and relationship management.³ I will use Goleman’s categories to describe how EI works in a congregational setting.

Pastor Carol⁴ is pastor of City United Methodist Church (UMC) whose surrounding demographics have transformed in the last twenty years. Like many congregations, City UMC is losing members and wondering how to move into the future while honoring its history and legacy. The congregation must choose between moving to the suburbs or focusing on inner city ministry. As Pastor Carol leads, she needs to exercise the skills of EI as she navigates both relational dynamics in the congregation and her own internal reactions. To do this, Carol must practice Goleman’s four elements of EI.

In this time of potential conflict, Carol knows several realities inside herself, practicing the skill of *self-awareness*. She wants the church to survive and thrive; she wants to be faithful to Jesus’ calling to the poor; she wants to ensure the survival of the community she has led for the past eight years. She wants to manage congregational conflict without it becoming destructive.

Pastor Carol must also exercise the EI skill of *self-management*. Leaders with skill in self-management can “find ways to manage their disturbing emotions and impulses

* Kristin Langstraat is CPE Manager at M Health Fairview, University of Minnesota Medical Center (Minneapolis). Email: Kristin.langstraat@Fairview.org.

and even channel them in useful ways.”⁵ For Carol, feeling angry is a signal for her to pay attention and tend to her needs. When anger arises, this often comes from her not feeling “important” — a dynamic she has addressed in therapy and which she knows comes from her family of origin. Some church members dig in their heels, adopting an all-or-nothing attitude about the challenges facing the church. Carol’s self-awareness is primary to her self-management in these relationships. She needs to know what she is feeling, what her values are, and what challenges she has in regulating her emotions in relationship to others.

This leads to *social awareness*, which includes skills such as empathy, organizational awareness, and service.⁶ Pastor Carol has loved these people through illnesses and life passages as well as facilitated their spiritual growth. She knows their lives and struggles. Carol’s social awareness helps her to understand both how she is connected to these people and how they are connected to each other.

The fourth element of EI is *relationship management*, seen in leaders who are inspirational and can lead change, manage conflict, and encourage teamwork and collaboration.⁷ As a facilitator of the visioning process, Carol navigates congregational relationships and helps others do so as well. Carol must encourage teamwork and collaboration among differing parties. She must attend to the ability of others to listen to one another and work together.

This is a typical ministry example of clergy needing to use their EI to navigate emotions as well as facilitate relationships with their congregants and community partners. So, where do UMC clergy learn these skills of EI? As a CPE educator, I have seen EI develop within CPE students. CPE is required in various religions and denominations and even some UMC annual conferences, but it is not required in annual conferences where I have served as clergy (Minnesota and West Ohio). So, I wondered: Where do UMC clergy develop their EI, especially those who have not done CPE?

WHY IS EI IMPORTANT FOR CLERGY?

Randall claims in his 2014 article about the EI of Anglican clergy, “Probably no skill is more important to a priest than the interpersonal grace and comfort that comes with EI, and those who appear to be eccentric, aloof or uncomfortably shy will have difficulty.”⁸ In addition, West et al. note:

The need for religious leaders to have EI is greater than for other professionals . . . because no other professional venue requires a person to manage as many emotional and spiritual burdens as are demanded by religious leadership. Our work challenges our internal fortitude, personal character, and individual resolve. It often requires us to exceed our limits and push ourselves into a state of compassion fatigue if we allow it.⁹

EI underlies many of the skills that clergy must perform every day. In addition, as communities become more diverse ideologically and demographically, EI helps all of us to navigate difference.¹⁰

Additionally, change evokes anxiety and grief in individuals and groups, necessitating help in managing these emotions; that management calls for EI from congregational leaders. In *Quietly Courageous: Leading the Church in a Changing World*, Gil Rendle, a senior consultant with the Texas Methodist Foundation, comments, "While clergy cannot do everything by themselves, congregations rarely do more than can be supported by the capacity and courage of their pastoral leaders."¹¹ Developing the relationship management and self-regulation skills of EI helps clergy to navigate the emotional impacts that happen when change inevitably occurs.

INTERVIEWS WITH CLERGY ABOUT EI

I interviewed nine clergy from the Minnesota and West Ohio Annual Conferences of the United Methodist Church (UMC). They had from four to thirty years of ministry experience (in various categories of UMC licensed and ordained ministry) and were all partnered, with seven heterosexual, one gay and one lesbian pastor. Eight were Euro-American and one was African American. Interviews were done to understand how they developed EI and whether their level of EI was sufficient for the tasks of ministry. Additionally, three other UMC clergy were interviewed who served on boards or committees shepherding candidates through the ordination process.¹² These interviews were done to understand the clergy's perception of candidates they interview. Do they perceive these candidates as having adequate EI skills for ministry? If not, what do they recommend for the development of EI skills?

Interviews were done using Brinkmann and Kvale's "semi-structured life world interview"¹³ to explore these pastors' emotional development with both set questions and follow-up questions to delve further. Interviews were subsequently coded using Atlas TI. Three main themes emerged, giving insight into how these clergy developed the EI they use in their ministry.

Theme 1: The importance of the presence of trusted adults in their lives

The first theme concerns the presence of trusted adults in the lives of the clergy when they were growing up. A typical comment was, "I had trusted adults around me that I knew loved me, and it was a safe place for me." Sometimes the trusted adults were parents. But there were other community members who helped them to grow and find a sense of themselves. In his book *Emotional Intelligence: Why It Can Matter More Than IQ*, Goleman notes that our families are the first places that we learn about EI.¹⁴ Interviewees were exposed to trusted adults in various venues: churches, community organizations, neighborhoods, and schools. These adults served as mentors,

encouragers, and sometimes stand-ins for adult family members who were no longer present.

One pastor described the variety of relationships she had growing up in this way:

I felt called to ministry in high school, and I've always had relationships with people who were older than me, who were younger than me, the kids, our youth group. And so, diverse generational relationships have always been incredibly important to me. My grandparents died, most of them when I was younger. . . . Just finding in the church—never replacements—but people who, if you're open, will step in in different ways for losses too. And that has always been, the church has generally been a place where I've seen loving, compassionate care.

Others found adults who believed in them in the school setting. One pastor learned a new awareness of who he was through these formative relationships: I never saw myself that way as a leader of any kind. And I believe [a particular teacher] saw something in me. . . . And it changed the way I understood myself as a leader, and . . . it gave me permission to begin to develop some leadership skills. But it was only because somebody else saw that opportunity waiting to happen in me.

One clergy person whose father had died when he was young talked about adults who helped to raise him. He commented that his mother had always been a really strong woman, very independent, and yet also built relationships with others. So, I often said I had lots of mothers growing up, 'cause she surrounded me with other people who cared for me, so I felt that care, that love.

Theme 2: The importance of diversity for learning

The second theme that emerged was that these clergy had experiences with difference, and they often sought out such experiences. A typical comment is, "I was being called away from the familiar." Four interviewees noted the diversity of student bodies at their seminaries, with several choosing to go to seminary outside of their home state. Some sought out racial diversity, and others experienced regional differences. Of those who traveled out of state for seminary, all interacted with a variety of Christian traditions, increasing their exposure to diverse theological beliefs. Others had military or missionary experiences.

One pastor noted:

I recognized quick—I didn't know it to have named it then—but I recognized quickly . . . I was being called away from the familiar, and that I was crystal clear about [that]. It was painful and it was really scary.

Another pastor who attended seminary outside of her native Ohio commented: I felt really called to kind of get outside of this, my context, and experience other parts of the United States and just other settings. . . . And I was listening to professors from a

variety of denominations, a variety of backgrounds. I had more diversity in all kinds of ways among my peers than I would have in college and really high school at all . . . and I was like, “Whoa, there’s a lot of ways of seeing the world and understanding Scripture” that I just had not been exposed to.

Others had experiences in different countries that were formative in terms of their self-understanding:

One of the greatest experiences was we had a conversation with an extremist group of Islam who gave us the most incredible hospitality I’ve seen before. . . . I think guided experiences outside your . . . not just your comfort zone . . . but where you’re forced to look inward, are really helpful.

Theme 3: The importance of learning from peers in both informal and formal relationships

Informal peer relationships were mentioned quite often by the clergy I interviewed. As one pastor put it, “I think that’s where I find the most help, is the spaces where I can be honest and vulnerable.” Some of those informal relationships occurred in their seminaries, while others had relationships with colleagues during their pastoral formation.

We would talk about it as students . . . “So, how do you do that?” . . . And then some people graduated ahead of me, and then they would come back and talk about what they were doing and what was working and what wasn’t. So, really early on it was that, “Make sure you develop a group of friends, make sure you have a life outside the church and all those kinds of things.”

Still another pastor noted the on-going importance of clergy friendships, saying: I would say that [one particular clergy colleague] has been probably the biggest influence in my life. He and I have had a fairly deep friendship for, gosh, over ten years, and he really has helped me understand a lot of things. He’s pushed me when I needed to be pushed, and he’s helped me, and we’ve helped each other.

Others noted the importance of their CPE experience—more formalized relationships where feedback was encouraged and even required: I’ve really never been in other settings where you’re practicing that rhythm on a regular basis and then having other people provide input into that too, and reflecting so deeply on specific interactions, so I found that to be extraordinarily helpful. . . . I’ll always be glad for the training of CPE. I don’t think anything else has prepared me for the church as well, in terms of just relating to people.

Another newer pastor commented, I absolutely loved every opportunity [in CPE]; it was frustrating and enlightening at the same time, but . . . I really, really came to understand, I think, a lot more about how I operate in social circles and how I regulate my own emotions in ways that I have not been directed to do before. . . . And then also seeing those blind spots and those weak spots to make sure that I don’t . . . I don’t feed them.

One interviewee who had served on ordaining bodies had also worked in clergy formation, organizing field education for seminary students. He noted, "The students that came back from [CPE] always were so much more aware of their ingrained assumptions and behaviors. . . . And what a gift. Because in my experience to have been in the church twenty years now, every parish I've served, every context I've served, there's always someone who hits my buttons. And early on I just blamed them, right? And then I realized that, through gifts like this, became an opportunity to say, 'All right, what is it about my life, my past, my present that is making my reaction so heightened?'"

A member of the Board of Ordained Ministry summarized all of this by saying, simply, "I think the best way to learn emotional intelligence is to be in community with people so that you can get immediate feedback."

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CLERGY FORMATION IN EMOTIONAL INTELLIGENCE

Interviewees noted, and research supports, the following essentials in learning EI needed for the tasks of ministry: (1) the importance of peers for learning and the diversity/contrast those relationships create, (2) facilitation as foundational for learning, (3) learning in context, and (4) engaging in ordination interviews in an emotionally intelligent way.¹⁵ These themes are intertwined with one another, focusing on the relational context of ministry and how pastors learn through contrast with others and awareness of themselves. White and Kimmons state that "emotional intelligence matters in pastoral leadership because ministry is all about relationships and because emotional intelligence is not static, it is of vital importance to anyone who seeks to train and equip pastoral leaders."¹⁶

The following recommendations for clergy formation emerged from the interviews above.

Recommendation 1: Ensure that pastors and pastoral candidates learn from peers—For support and challenge

In their report on the Transition into Ministry project, Wind and Wood note, "One way to frame the difference between the way new clergy entered their pastoral ministries a century ago and the way that they do today is to see the transition into ministry as a story of the loss of natural communities of practice and repeated attempts to compensate for that loss."¹⁷

Clergy have lost some natural community connections that they might have had as pastors many years ago. Today clergy function amid complex and often mobile lives, sometimes moving for their training and ministerial appointments. The UMC credentialing process seeks to provide stability in the person of a mentor. Others in

formation may be involved in peer groups during the candidacy process. Some annual conferences have sought to require various types of peer groups. With the ubiquity of Zoom and other platforms, there is no longer an excuse for ‘lone rangers’ or isolation in ministry. Yet this isolation still happens.

Distinguishing between learning and support is important when looking at clergy groups. Some annual conferences encourage covenant/cluster groups. And while they seem to provide support to those who participate, their main focus is not necessarily on growth or education. *Annual Conferences need clarity about whether groups that clergy participate in are for learning or support.* Surely both can happen in peer groups. But often groups created for learning will need a facilitator. Clergy need support, yet by and large they are more able and willing to give support to others than they are to give challenge. As seen above, engaging the challenges that come from differing points of view can lead to fruitful growth in EI.

All interviewees cited an encounter with diversity as fundamental in developing clergy EI. This accords with many learning theories in which learning requires experiences that upset the learner’s equilibrium. Contrast might occur because of major demographic differences. But smaller differences can highlight that the way one thinks is not the way everyone thinks.¹⁸ In addition, current U.S. culture is not only diverse, it is polarized. The church is one place where attention to functioning amid difference has been paramount from the start, as seen in Paul’s admonition in 1 Corinthians 12.¹⁹ Responding with a desire to learn instead of responding with polarization is an important witness for the church in a divided society. But this posture requires self-regulation amid the strong emotions that pastors and congregants might experience when their worldviews are challenged.

Recommendation 2: Take seriously the importance of facilitation for clergy learning

Clergy learn the EI competencies of functioning amid diversity by *being in the midst of diversity* and being guided in how to navigate it. And this diversity can lead to conflict. Goleman et al. state,

The problem is, these conversations are ‘hot’ and many leaders are afraid to start the dialogue— fearful of taking it to the primal dimension. Too often, unsure of their ability to handle the emotions that do arise when people talk honestly about what is going on, leaders stick to the safe topics.²⁰

In successful learning groups, these dynamics are engaged by having skilled, emotionally intelligent facilitators who can hold the anxiety of a group as it learns and explores differences and conflict.²¹ In churches, pastors often facilitate groups. Clergy need to have experiences of being held in conflict, of experiencing conflict that leads to growth, so they will be able to lead the groups in their congregation in fruitful exploration of differences.

Facilitation is key for clergy learning. In my CPE groups, many beginning students imagine gathering ministry peers together in their community or denomination, consulting about challenges, church conflicts, and personal obstacles in ministry. When they try to form these groups and do not get the same results that they had in CPE, they are confused. What they have lacked is a facilitator who can hold group members accountable with feedback that can bring tension and challenge.

In his study on how hospice nurses learn their trade, Clarke also notes the importance of psychological safety in the workplace, specifically if one is to engage in dialogue and reflection to develop emotional ability in the workplace.²² The pastors I interviewed confirmed this—trust is important to peer relationships for learning. Contextual learning in a safe enough relational environment is fundamental.²³

Facilitators who keep group members engaged, particularly amid discomfort, assist clergy in learning EI. This is especially true since UMC clergy do not seem to be a risk-taking bunch and need some help with this. In his survey of clergy effectiveness, DeShon (2010) found that, of the 341 pastors surveyed, “Risk taking was the lowest ranked personal characteristic and also was lowest self-assessed competency.”²⁴ Successful training methods (Transition into Ministry, clinical pastoral education, Clergy Development Groups in Texas) have a facilitator who helps to focus the group on their guiding task.

Recommendation 3: Help clergy learn in context

Much has been written about how people learn as well as *where* they learn. Candidates for ministry often learn “context-free” information in seminary. As they move beyond these first stages of learning, they progress to the *competence* stage.²⁵ For clergy to be invested in the decisions they make in ministry, they must be ultimately responsible for the outcome of their decisions, requiring learners to “decide for themselves in each situation what plan or perspective to adopt without being sure that it will turn out to be appropriate.”²⁶ Generally, beginning learners (in internships or field education) have an overseeing pastor who will take ultimate responsibility for the workings of the church. Here, learning happens “in context.” Rendle (2019) notes that moving into Dreyfus’s competence stage “requires two additional factors: *a willingness to be overwhelmed* and an *acceptance of ultimate responsibility*.”²⁷

Achieving competence in ministry is not just a stage that clergy traverse at the beginning of their careers. Pastors need humility and a continued curiosity about themselves and their vocation as their careers progress. As Wind and Wood state: “The movement from novice to expert is not a path once traveled; it is a pathway traversed again and again. . . . Ongoing pastoral formation requires the capacity to re-engage the experience of being a novice without being intimidated by it.”²⁸

In addition, clergy cited learning in context as crucial to how they continued to develop their EI throughout their careers. By bouncing ideas off peers and encountering

“disorienting dilemmas”²⁹ in interacting with other worldviews, contextual education—whether formal or informal—was foundational. Rabbi Dr. Rachel Mikva of Chicago Theological Seminary recommends that contextual education should be “a thread throughout, not an episode in student’s theological education.”³⁰ In his findings with hospice nurses mentioned above, Clarke states, “Dialogue and reflection may well be two of the chief mechanisms associated with the learning process.”³¹

Recommendation 4: Train credentialing bodies in emotionally intelligent interviewing

Finally, those on credentialing committees must also have the EI to evaluate the potential pastor in front of them. Thus, training of those who evaluate clergy and clergy candidates is a crucial step in ensuring that emotionally intelligent pastors are leading our congregations.

The 2018 UMC *Board of Ordained Ministry Handbook* includes many substantive sample questions that members can use as they interview candidates for ministry.³² And yet, board and committee members also need to practice self-examination during the interview. Goleman et al.’s four areas of EI can be informative in this self-examination.

Self-Awareness: As committee members interview candidates, they check in with themselves, asking core questions. How do I react to this candidate, or to other members of the interview team? Does my reaction seem especially strong or out of balance? Does this person remind me of anyone in my life, or from my past?

(2) *Self-Management:* After the committee member has noticed their reactions, they then manage their emotional self. What do they know about themselves that helps them to manage their reaction? Is there something happening between them, the interviewee, or the committee that needs to be addressed? Or is the reaction something that the committee member must deal with outside of the interview? In paying attention to their emotions and managing them, they discover important information about their relationship to the interviewee or the other interviewers, allowing them to ask questions informed by the relationships around them.

(3) *Social Awareness:* How does the committee member understand the context of the interview and what it means for the interviewee to have their self and ministry examined? Is the committee member informed by their own experiences in important professional moments in their own life? How do they perceive the relationships in the room and how the group is functioning together? Is the committee member aware of how they help or hinder that functioning? Observing the interactions of the group can give committee members a sense of why the interviewee might react the way that they do.

(4) *Relationship Management:* Committee members are not only asking questions but observing the interviewee. How does the ministry candidate manage relationships

in the interview? How does the committee member encourage and challenge the interviewee? Are there conflicts that need to be managed during the interview?

Langstraat 10

Management of relationships shows up while negotiating conflict, coaching, and influencing what happens during the interview, as well as through the teamwork one demonstrates in working with peers during the interview process.

CONCLUSION

This exploration of EI in UMC pastors began by seeking to understand how clergy develop EI, utilize EI in their ministries, and evaluate the EI of potential candidates for ministry. EI is essential for pastoral work. Encountering congregants through life transitions, conflict, and a polarized society are sensitive and important tasks for clergy, which require EI for clergy to be both effective and resilient. While we want clergy to have EI, we may not be training our clergy in effective ways to achieve that outcome. The interviews highlighted the various ways that clergy had developed EI throughout their lives and ministries. Credentialing bodies have an interview process for potential clergy that have strengths but could be improved with attention to EI. This goes not only for those being interviewed but also for those who evaluate those candidates. Going forward, it would be fruitful to measure the EI of more clergy, as has been done in the Kentucky Annual Conference of the UMC³³ and in Great Britain and Ireland.³⁴ After analyzing the data, effective training programs could be developed and tested to address the specific areas of EI that are lacking. The recommendations I have included are a means to the end of creating emotionally intelligent pastors who can lead the church through today's challenges and into a complex future.

NOTES

¹ In this article, when I refer to "pastors" I am referring to the United Methodist system of clergy: i.e., the category of "pastors" includes any person serving as a professional minister within the UMC (licensed local pastors, ordained elders and deacons, and those serving churches in the ordination process).

² John D. Mayer, Peter Salovey, and David R. Caruso, "Emotional Intelligence: Theory, Findings, and Implications," *Psychological Inquiry*, 15, no. 3 (2004), 197.

³ Hay Group (2011). Hay Group, *Emotional and Social Competency Inventory (ESCI): A User Guide for Accredited Practitioners* (L&T direct and the McClelland Center for Research and Innovation, 2011).

⁴ Pastor Carol is a fictional pastor confronting current challenges that are relevant to many clergy.

⁵ Daniel Goleman, Richard Boyatzis, and Annie McKee, *Primal Leadership: Realizing the Power of Emotional Intelligence* (Boston: Harvard Business School Press, 2002), 254.

⁶ Goleman, Boyatzis, and McKee, *Primal Leadership*, 255.

⁷ Goleman, Boyatzis, and McKee, *Primal Leadership*, 256.

⁸ Kelvin John Randall, "Emotional Intelligence: What Is It, and Do Anglican Clergy Have It?" *Mental Health, Religion, & Culture* 17, no. 3 (2014), 269.

Langstraat 11

⁹ John Lee West, Roy M. Oswald, and Nadyne Guzman, *Emotional Intelligence for Religious Leaders* (New York: Rowman & Littlefield, 2018), 3.

¹⁰ Lee Gardenswartz, Jorge Cherbosque, and Anita Rowe, "Emotional Intelligence and Diversity: A Model for Differences in the Workplace," *Journal of Psychological Issues in Organizational Culture*, 1, no. 1 (2010).

¹¹ Gil Rendle, *Quietly Courageous: Leading the Church in a Changing World* (New York: Rowman and Littlefield, 2019), 125.

¹² The boards and committees were District Committees on Ordained Ministry and Boards of Ordained Ministry.

¹³ Svend Brinkmann and Steinar Kvale, *InterViews: Learning the Craft of Qualitative Research Interviewing* (Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage, 2015), 155.

¹⁴ Daniel Goleman, *Emotional Intelligence: Why It Can Matter More Than IQ for Character, Health and Lifelong Achievement* (New York: Bantam, 1995).

¹⁵ See Nicholas Clarke, "Developing Emotional Intelligence through Workplace Learning: Findings from a Case Study in Healthcare," *Human Resource Development International* 9, no. 4 (2006). <https://doi.org/10.1080/13678860601032585>; Nicholas Clarke, "Developing Emotional Intelligence Abilities through Team-Based Learning," *Human Resource Development Quarterly* 21, no. 2 (2010): 119–38, <https://doi.org/10.1002/hrdq.20036>; Jill Anne Hendron, Pauline Irving, and Brian J. Taylor, "The Emotionally Intelligent Ministry: Why It Matters," *Mental Health, Religion and Culture* 17, no. 5 (2013): 470–78. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13674676.2013.848424>; Gil Rendle, *Quietly Courageous: Leading the Church in a Changing World* (New York: Rowman and Littlefield, 2019); West et al., *Emotional Intelligence for Religious Leaders*; James P. Wind and David J. Wood, *Becoming a Pastor: Reflections on the Transition into Ministry* (Herndon, VA: The Alban Institute, 2008).

¹⁶ Douglas A. White and Matthew Kimmons, "Clergy Education and the Development of Emotional Intelligence: An Analysis of United Methodist Clergy in Kentucky," *Christian Education Journal* 16, no. 2 (2019): 371, <https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/0739891319847701>.

¹⁷ Wind and Wood, *Becoming a Pastor*, 16.

¹⁸ For example, in my training as an ACPE certified educator in Minnesota, I often had groups of four White Lutheran students. In lieu of religious and racial diversity, I needed to look at the ways other differences made learning fruitful, such as theological perspective, urban/suburban/rural backgrounds, age, and gender differences.

¹⁹ "The eye cannot say to the hand, 'I have no need of you,' nor again the head to the feet, 'I have no need of you.' On the contrary, the members of the body that seem to be weaker are indispensable, and those members of the body that we think less honorable we clothe with greater honor, and our less respectable members are treated with greater respect; whereas our more respectable members do not need this. But God has so arranged the body, giving the greater honor to the inferior member, that there may be no dissension within the body, but the members may have the same care for one another. If one member suffers, all suffer together with it; if one member is honored, all rejoice together with it" (I Corinthians 12:21–26 NRSV).

²⁰ Goleman, Boyatzis, and McKee, *Primal Leadership*, 189.

²¹ Examples of successful learning groups are CPE groups and Clergy Development Groups formed by the Texas Methodist Foundation (as referenced in Rendle, *Quietly Courageous*).

Langstraat 12

Certified educator candidates in the ACPE must achieve the following competencies in order to lead CPE groups:

P1.9 Demonstrates a non-anxious and non-judgmental stance when engaging differences and managing conflict.

P2.10 Facilitates dialogue and conflict resolution by attending to content and process of communication.

P2.12 Recognizes the impact of the psychological dynamics of projection, parallel process, and differentiation on the educational process.

<https://www.manula.com/manuals/acpe/acpe-manuals/2016/en/topic/part-iii-the-certification-process>

²² Clarke, "Developing Emotional Intelligence," 456.

²³ See Brian Arao and Kristi Clemens, "From Safe Spaces to Brave Spaces: A New Way to Frame Dialogue around Diversity and Social Justice," in *The Art of Effective Facilitation*, ed. Lisa M. Landreman (Sterling, VA: Stylus Publishing, 2013), 135–50.

²⁴ Richard P. DeShon, "Clergy Effectiveness: National Survey Results" (General Board of Higher Education and Ministry of the United Methodist Church, 2010), 20.

²⁵ Stuart E. Dreyfus, "The Five-Stage Model of Adult Skill Acquisition," *Bulletin of Science, Technology, & Society* 24, no. 3 (2004): 178.

²⁶ Dreyfus, "The Five-Stage Model," 178. In our CPE programs, this is done by including hospital shifts where students are on call by themselves; they are ultimately responsible for the care of patients in the hospital during those shifts.

²⁷ Rendle, *Quietly Courageous*, 137, emphasis in original.

²⁸ Wind and Wood, *Becoming a Pastor*, 28.

²⁹ The phrase "disorienting dilemma" was coined by Jack Mezirow in speaking of an event that happens at the beginning of the learning process, when a learner's perspective begins to be transformed. The disorienting dilemma is followed by several stages, including reflecting on one's assumptions, trying out new behaviors, and reintegrating the new insights learned. See Jack Mezirow, "Transformation Theory of Adult Learning," in *In Defense of the Lifeworld: Critical Perspectives on Adult Learning*, ed. Michael R. Welton (Albany: SUNY University Press, 1995), 50.

³⁰ "A Conversation with Rev. Dr. Frank Yamada & Rabbi Dr. Rachel Mikva" [Audio podcast episode], 40:15, 2021, Imagining the Future of Theological Education, Christian Theological Seminary, https://www.buzzsprout.com/1493950/6674513-a-conversation-with-rev-dr-frank-yamada-rabbi-dr-rachel-mikva?client_source=small_player&iframe=true&referrer=https://www.buzzsprout.com/1493950/6674513-a-conversation-with-rev-dr-frank-yamada-dr-rachel-mikva.js?container_id=buzzsprout-player-6674513&player=small.

³¹ Clarke, "Developing Emotional Intelligence," 455.

³² United Methodist Church, *Board of Ordained Ministry Handbook* (2016).
<https://www.bomlibrary.org/board-of-ordained-ministry-handbook/>

³³ Douglas A. White and Matthew Kimmons, "Clergy Education and the Development of Emotional Intelligence: An Analysis of United Methodist Clergy in Kentucky," *Christian*

Education Journal 16, no. 2 (2019): 369–78,
<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/10.1177/0739891319847701>.

Langstraat 13

³⁴ Randall, “Emotional Intelligence,” 262–70; Hendron et al., “The Emotionally Intelligent Ministry”; Leslie J. Francis, V. John Payne, and Neville Emslie, “Just How Emotionally Intelligent Are Religious Leaders in Britain? A Study among Anglican Clergy in Wales,” *Pastoral Psychology* 68 (2019): 261–69, <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s11089-018-0845-x>; Leslie J. Francis, Neville Emslie, and V. John Payne, “The Effect of Emotional Intelligence on Work-Related Psychological Health among Anglican Clergy in Wales,” *Journal of Religion and Health* 58, no. 5 (2019): 1631–47, <https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/s10943-019-00798-7>.